

**MEETING MINUTES SUMMARY
GOVERNOR'S MILITARY AFFAIRS COMMISSION
and the
ARIZONA MILITARY AFFAIRS COMMISSION
Tuesday, April 12, 2005 10 a.m. to 2:30 p.m.
Eagle's Nest Clubhouse, Goodyear, AZ**

OPENING REMARKS

Co-Chair Lisa Atkins opened the meeting and welcomes the Military Affairs Commission (MAC) members and guests. She thanked Robson Communities, particularly Jim Poulus, Marty Mossberg and Kristin Pace, for hosting not only the meeting, but also hosting the lunch for the Commissioners.

ROLL CALL & INSTRUCTIONS

Commissioners Present:

- Lisa Atkins, Co-Chair, West Valley
- Tom Finnegan, Co-Chair, Sierra Vista
- Mayor James Cavanaugh, Goodyear (arrived at 11:45 am)
- Supervisor Sandie Smith, Pinal County
- Supervisor Lenore Stuart, Yuma County
- Dr. William D. Carrell, Jr., Tucson
- Brig. General Tom Browning, Phoenix (left the meeting at 10:15 a.m.)
- Michael Francis, West Valley
- Lt. Gen. Bob Johnston, Tucson
- Monsignor Richard O'Keeffe, Yuma

Commissioners Absent:

- Mayor Tom Hessler, Sierra Vista
- Mayor Robert Walkup
- Priscilla Storm
- Nancy Stump
- Senator Thayer Verschoor, Arizona State Senate

Co-Chair Lisa Atkins indicated that the Legislature is in session, making it impossible for two Commissioners (Sen. Verschoor and Nancy Stump) and two presenters (Sen. Waring and Rep. Nelson) to attend and participate in today's meeting.

Ex-Officio Members Present:

- Patricia Boland, Office of the Attorney General
- Deb Sydenham, Arizona Department of Commerce
- Bill Ruddick, US Bureau of Land Management
- Patrick F. Chorpenning, Military Policy Advisor to the Governor (arrived at 10:30 a.m.)

Co-Chair Lisa Atkins emphasized the work and support of our Ex Officio members. While we recognize that the military installation commanders generally preclude their attendance, we welcome any updates that they or their representatives wish to provide. She also welcomed Megan Murphy and Gabe Forsberg, both of whom work for Pat

Chorpenning at the Arizona Department of Veterans' Services. They serve as administrative support to the Military Affairs Commission.

Comment cards and handouts were placed at a table at the rear of the room. Those wishing to speak are encouraged to complete a card and turn it in to Gabe Forsberg or to Pat Chorpenning who will join the meeting after a scheduled teleconference at the Governor's Office.

Given some time constraints in this morning's schedule, the first agenda item will be a presentation by Gen. Tom Browning.

BRAC (Base Realignment and Closure) PROCESS

General Browning presented an update on BRAC process and beyond. The criteria for closing and realigning military installations were provided on a handout for the commissioners. Gen. Browning noted that it will be extremely difficult to remove an installation from the list once it has been included, requiring 7 of 9 of the BRAC members to remove an installation from the list. Gen. Browning strongly encouraged all MAC members to do their homework on their installations now and to plan for the worst. The investment of time to identify all mission capabilities and how public-government partnerships are working will be invaluable - regardless of the published list produced by BRAC. Gen. Browning emphasized that May 16 is the date the list is to be disseminated, but the MAC cannot relax after the publication date.

The Military Affairs Commission is looking at a twenty-year horizon. There is a perceived threat that when the BRAC list has been published, the sense of urgency will be decreased. There may be a tendency to whittle away at the land exchange proposal and the funding to mitigate encroachment. Co-chair Finnegan asked if Gen. Browning had any information regarding the BRAC list and was told that there were severe penalties for those who are preparing the information if any information were leaked before the public dissemination date.

When asked about the confirmation schedule for BRAC Members, Co-Chair Lisa Atkins indicated that the BRAC Chair, Anthony Principi, and Commissioners had received a "Recess appointment" from the President, and confirmation will not be required. Once the BRAC list becomes public, the process will be very open. Supervisor Sandie Smith clarified that the MAC needed to be prepared to weigh in if any of Arizona's military installations are included on the BRAC list.

QDR - DoD is in the midst of a QDR that may shed light on Secretary Rumsfeld's philosophy or strategic direction for the Department of Defense. When that publication is available, it will be sent out to all MAC Commissioners.

LUKE AIR FORCE BASE BRIEFING

Luke AFB

Col. Pete Costello made a presentation about Luke's mission, utilizing a PowerPoint presentation. There have been 53,000 pilots trained since it opened in 1941. The briefing included information about Barry M. Goldwater Range (BMGR), which has multiple users such as its sister wing, the 944th Fighter Wing. Col. Costello's presentation also included three areas of particular concern to Luke AFB at this time:

encroachment, unauthorized personnel on BMGR, and the Arizona Transaction Privilege Tax. Co-Chair Lisa Atkins asked that he provide greater detail relative to the tax.

Gen. Johnston asked where other training occurs and Col. Costello indicated that Lackland AFB in San Antonio and Springfield, IL. Co-Chair Lisa Atkins asked if the airspace conflicts were manageable. Col. Costello indicated that Luke was building working relationships with Sky Harbor. There may be an opportunity to change the classification of air space in high use area to require that general aviation contact the control towers at Luke of their presence. Michael Francis described how civilian aircraft may be required to fly below certain altitudes that are used by pilots coming out of Luke AFB.

Questions regarding wind power generation in military training routes (MTRs) were raised. Deb Sydenham offered her assistance in working with the Department of Energy so that current maps are available as decisions are made as to the placement of windmills (some as high as 400 ft.).

Lisa Atkins concluded by thanking Luke for including the Commission in the Commanders' Summit.

944th Fighter Wing

Col. Derek P. Rydholm, Commander, 944th Fighter Wing, Luke AFB, provided a slide presentation highlighting the capabilities of his command. This is the largest Reserve Fighter Wing and was essentially started with the Tuskegee Airmen were activated. The briefing included various aspects of its citizen soldiers, an explanation of traditional reservists vs. Active Guard & Reserve (AGR), and phenomenal military experience of his personnel. The presentation ended at 11:55 and a lunch recess was called.

Reconvened following lunch at 12:35 p.m. Co-Chair Tom Finnegan described certain changes to the agenda because we were not to receive the Legislative Update that was planned.

YUMA PROVING GROUND/ELECTRONIC PROVING GROUND BRIEFING

A briefing was provided by Bill Rezin, Director of Planning and Operations - Yuma Proving Ground. The installation also has satellite activities in Panama and Alaska. Joint Experimentation Range Complex is a partnership with EPG. Yuma Proving Ground was described as the means to field test equipment in close to true combat situations (such as building bridges over the Colorado River).

The next presentation was from Dave Kelso for the Electronic Proving Ground, where software is tested at Ft. Huachuca. Mr. Kelso indicated that 80% to 87% of the costs to run the EPG are reimbursable and they operate much like a private enterprise. He described his relationship with Yuma Proving Ground as a true partnership. Both installations send out test teams to each other. Historically, YPG and EPG have never been in competition and their test missions have not overlapped.

Co-chair Tom Finnegan indicated that commissioners had received the October 2004 and January 2005 minutes and those copies are available today. The October 2004 minutes were unanimously approved as prepared. Mayor James Cavanaugh offered one correction to the January 2005 minutes on page two, paragraph five to read, "Mayor

Hessler said that they were chasing rumors at Ft. Huachuca about the next BRAC list." A motion was made to accept the minutes as modified. It passed unanimously.

COMMISSIONERS REPORTS

Dr. Bill Carrell distributed a handout for the Commissioners about how the DM50 deals with issues of importance to neighborhoods in Tucson. Because some discussions become confrontational when dealing with groups, they have been working with a disinterested third party to assist in arbitration. Dr. Carrell wanted to share information about conflict resolution available from the Udall Institute.

Lisa Atkins attended the Commanders' Summit. They will include her in their quarterly meetings, as well as their working group on undocumented aliens and the impact on the installations. Since the members of the Legislature were unable to attend today, Rep. Nelson assure her that a second year's appropriation for the Military Installation Fund was included in the FY06 budget.

Mayor James Cavanagh: No report.

Lenore Stuart reported that Deb Sydenham made a presentation to the Yuma County Board of Supervisors regarding the Joint Land Use Studies (JLUS). Ms. Stuart wanted to clear up any confusion regarding Yuma County's stance on JLUS. She had seen an article claiming that they were in opposition of the JLUS in Yuma and she wanted to verify that they were actually in support of the JLUS in Yuma.

Monsignor O'Keeffe reported that Yuma Proving Ground (YPG) was hosting some very influential visitors and that NBC Nightly News will be doing a story on the YPG. He saw the same article that Lenora Stuart mentioned.

Co-Chair Tom Finnegan said that he could not recall the bill number, but understood that Rep. John Nelson was going to work to protect military installations by ensuring that purchases of property near a military installation would require notification of its proximity.

REPORTS AND DISCUSSION:

Military Installation Fund

Sherri Lee, Arizona Department of Commerce, presented information regarding the Rulemaking process. There will be four stakeholder meetings to obtain public comment and she invited all to attend one in a location nearest to them. She sent out a press release of the proposed rulemaking, including dates of various meetings where interested parties may learn about the rules, learn of comments received from stakeholders, and provide public comment. Copies of the proposed rules were distributed as well as a flow chart of how the rulemaking process works. She reported that they plan to submit the final Rules to the Governor's Regulatory Review Council (GRRC) on May 20, 2005.

The Arizona Department of Commerce is working on an Intergovernmental Service Agreement with the Arizona Department of Veterans' Services so that the details of the

Military Installation Fund are carefully spelled out and funds can be transferred. If there are substantive issues that come up through the public meetings, the rules may be delayed approximately 45 days. However, Sherri explained that the Subcommittee had established the process so that public comments were incorporated in the beginning of the process so that the rules can be approved at the July 12th meeting of the Governor's Regulatory Review Council. At the beginning of 2006, the Fund should be in a position to approve applications and have monies disbursed.

Supervisor Lenore Stuart thanked Sherri Lee for being so organized and keeping the process on track. Co-Chair Atkins asked when the MAC will become involved in the distribution of funds. Deb Sydenham indicated that the lateness of getting the money out to applicants has been because we are doing two processes at the same time. Rulemaking includes the details of how the applications will be processed and how funds will be distributed. Lisa thanked Sherri Lee, Deb Sydenham, Patty Boland, Sue Allender, and Tim Lawless for their tireless efforts to get these rules ready.

Joint Land Use Studies.

Deb Sydenham indicated that Supervisor Lenore Stuart spoke about her visit to Yuma. In attendance were the Yuma County Board of Supervisors, General Jensen from Miramar, and Col. Cooney, Commander of the Marine Corps Air Station. She also met with the Yuma City Council. JLUS is a guiding, recommending document - implementation has been more difficult than anticipated. Gila Bend JLUS was completed this year and she will be meeting there in May. Ms. Sydenham has been waiting to do JLUS in Pinal County and Silverbell/WAATS. There are some issues at DoD, regarding the definition of "jurisdiction" regarding Guard facilities, which may mean that no grants will be available until after BRAC.

There has not been any recommendation of doing a JLUS at the Yuma Proving Ground. Ms. Sydenham suggested that this might be a highly desirable JLUS focus now, before land development complicates the issue. Co-Chair Lisa Atkins asked Deb about contacting Rep. John Nelson (Chairman, House Cities, Counties and Military Affairs) to coordinate the work between the planned Silverbell/WAATS JLUS and any legislative work group that Rep. Nelson is planning over the summer and for the next Legislative Session.

Fighter Country Partnership

Jody Roberts, Executive Director, provided the briefing on Fighter Country Partnership. They have 27 community and business leaders on their board of directors and more than 300 individual and corporate sponsors. The organization's mission is "guaranteeing the US Air Force's mission at Luke." They are involved in various fund raising activities, community outreach and education, and producing a quarterly newsletter (called FCP Visions with a distribution of 27,000). Ms. Roberts mentioned that there have been collaborative efforts in the past to work with the other community support groups around the State, and the FCP Board would like to resume these types of partnerships with community support groups around the State.

DEVELOPMENT OF SUBCOMMITTEE/STUDY GROUPS

Arizona Report Card/Best Practices: Co-Chair Finnegan will chair this group. The issue of Arizona Transaction Privilege Tax discussed during the Luke AFB briefing may fall into this category.

Legislative/Public Policy: Lenora Stuart is willing to help, but would prefer not to chair this subcommittee.

Arizona Military Installation Report Update (Published December 2004) is being revised. This is a good foundation for the Commission and it is being updated now. One installation is still working on providing an update, but all others have been received. Co-Chair Lisa Atkins indicated that Stuart Goodman, of Goodman-Schwartz, has written a comprehensive legislative history regarding Arizona law as it relates to the military installations in the State. Copies will be furnished to MAC Commissioners after this Legislative session ends.

Strategic Planning: Gen. Johnston will chair this group and will request that Gen. Browning also serve on this subcommittee. Gen. Johnston indicated that regardless of the BRAC outcome, we need long term strategies.

Military Installation Fund: Co-Chair Lisa Atkins is cautiously optimistic that the committee will be able to report that the rules are adopted as written. The work is not completely over when the rules are adopted, but reviews going forward are expected to be easier than the creation of the original rule drafting.

Public Outreach: Monsignor O'Keeffe is a committee of one. Sandie Smith offered to help. Co-Chair Tom Finnegan indicated that the commission is too small to rely on a single person for outreach and felt that all commissioners would become involved.

Airspace & Military Training Routes (MTRs): Co-Chair Lisa Atkins asked Pat Chorpenning what the plans are for the Governor's Air Space Commission and how their missions differ. Mr. Chorpenning indicated that they should ask for clarification when he and the Co-Chairs meet with the Governor's Chief of Staff this week.

Arizona National Guard & Reserve Issues: Sandie Smith is willing to chair, and to also help with the Public Outreach subcommittee.

CURRENT & FUTURE ACTIONS ITEMS

Co-Chair Lisa Atkins indicated that there was one action item from the January meeting that is completed. Each commissioner received an updated list of the Arizona Legislature in their agenda packets. She also asked Kevin O'Berry, of Luke AFB, if the information provided by Deb Sydenham regarding the Arizona Energy Office, located within the Arizona Department of Commerce, addresses the concerns expressed regarding the approval process for wind turbines in Arizona.

Deb Sydenham indicated that there is a newly appointed board of Defense and Aerospace Commission. Department of Commerce was asked to staff the Commission, but was concerned that there may be a nexus there. Pat Chorpenning indicated that he would discuss this group's mission during the meeting with the Chief of Staff this week.

Co-Chair Finnegan said there is a program called the Joint Civilian Orientation Conference (JCOC) where influential civilians are selected to participate in a program sponsored by the Secretary of Defense. Representative Jennifer Burns has been selected by the Department of Defense to participate in the next JCOC trip. The purpose is to gain better understanding of national defense policies and programs. He will provide additional information at the next regular meeting, if there is interest. The FCP Vision newsletter contains a story about the program on page 18.

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

No comment cards were received.

Monsignor O'Keefe wanted to recognize representation from the Yuma Proving Grounds (YPG). Yoli Canales, Assistant Public Relations Office at the Yuma Proving Ground, attended the meeting. Chuck Wullenjohn was unable to attend the meeting because of pressing media business at YPG.

Deb Sydenham mentioned that NAID is scheduled in Denver from June 4 to 7. The dates of the meeting were changed because of the May 16th release of the BRAC list. The winter meeting is held annually in Tempe in the winter and additional information may be obtained from www.NAID.org.

Pat Chorpenning indicated he met with Gen. Browning yesterday. He echoes Gen. Browning's concerns that Arizona lawmakers may not take their 20-year commitment seriously, if no Arizona military installation is included on the list release next month by BRAC. Encroachment is a serious concern and will continue to plague Arizona military installations long after May 16. Co-Chair Tom Finnegan indicated that the commission agreed with his assessment. Mr. Chorpenning also emphasized that Arizona has a phenomenal opportunity to benefit from the realignment part of the BRAC.

FUTURE MEETING DATES AND LOCATIONS

Immediately following the publication of the BRAC list, the Military Affairs Commission will meet at 10:00 a.m. on May 17th at the Department of Commerce in Phoenix, to discuss the outcome of the BRAC and review comments from the stakeholders' meetings on the proposed Military Installation Fund rules and regulations.

The next regular Military Affairs Commission meeting has been tentatively set for Wednesday, July 13, which may present a problem for Sandie Smith. The reason that is falls on a Wednesday was to accommodate the Governor's Regulatory Review Council meeting where the Military Installation Fund rules will hopefully be approved. Pat Chorpenning offered to find a meeting location at the State Capitol, potentially the 2nd Floor Conference Room.

The meeting was adjourned at 2:23 p.m.